

Last Names of Authors: _____

Criteria for Top Research Paper – ILA Research Committee 2005-2006

Basic Criteria (possible disqualification criteria) _____ / 5

- Was the paper submitted in the manner specified by the call?
- Is the manuscript void of author references?
- Does the manuscript adhere to the specified style manual?

Overall Organization, Writing Style, and Adherence to Grammatical Standards _____ / 10

- Was the paper coherent?
- Were the arguments presented in an organized and clear pattern?
- Was the manuscript free of grammatical and spelling errors?
- Is there a clear thesis or central focus?

Theoretical and Practical Focus/Strength of Argument _____ / 30

- Does the manuscript have a clear practical and theoretical focus?
- If plausible, are other accounts offered to explain the phenomena under question?
- Are the research questions/hypotheses supported by past research?
- Is the research presented original?
- Does the manuscript present enough prior research to support relevant arguments?
- How thorough is the literature review? Are there clear indications that research is ignored?
- Is past research represented accurately?
- Do the results support, extend, or modify existing or newly established theory? (Do the results support, extend, or modify existing or newly established pragmatic concerns?)

Methodological Rigor _____ / 25

- Are the methods appropriate to the central research agenda?
- Do the central research questions or hypotheses make evident the motivating framework underlying the research agenda? (i.e., is the work funded by positivist, instrumentalist, interpretivists, or critical platform? Is a social, political, or economic context provided necessary to description of the investigation processes?)
- Are the methods explained thoroughly? Are epistemological derivatives, commitments, and constraints clearly identified, transparent, and coherent?
- Does the method delimit its application?
- Is the approach to data recovery, collection, analysis, and interpretation carefully described and delimited?
- Does the method discuss disciplinary / interdisciplinary influences
- Are the methods used in a systematic fashion?

Presentation and Explanation of Results _____ / 30

- Are all relevant results presented?
- Are the results presented with organization and clarity?
- Does the discussion indicate the reflexivity of the researching agents / agencies?
- Are the results clearly connected to the rationale?
 - Are the results explained in reference to theoretical implications?
 - Are the results explained in reference to pragmatic implications?
- Are the results explained in reference to both theory and application?
- Does the manuscript explore limitations to the present study?
- Are possible future research projects presented?

TOTAL: _____ / 100